

Gilberts. FAO: Douglas Thomson 39 Grassmarket Edinburgh EH1 2HS Ms Smith 22 Victoria Road North Berwick EH39 4JL

#### Decision date: 23 May 2023

#### TOWN AND COUNTRY PLANNING (SCOTLAND) ACTS DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT PROCEDURE (SCOTLAND) REGULATIONS 2013

Change of use: Sui Generis flatted residential to short-term let accommodation (in retrospect).

At 6 Stafford Street Edinburgh EH3 7AU

#### Application No: 22/06066/FULSTL

# DECISION NOTICE

With reference to your application for Planning Permission STL registered on 2 December 2022, this has been decided by **Local Delegated Decision**. The Council in exercise of its powers under the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Acts and regulations, now determines the application as **Refused** in accordance with the particulars given in the application.

Any condition(s) attached to this consent, with reasons for imposing them, or reasons for refusal, are shown below;

#### Reason for Refusal:-

1. The proposal is contrary to National Planning Framework 4 Policy 30(e) (ii) in respect of Loss of Residential Accommodation, as the the loss of a residential property has not been justified.

Please see the guidance notes on our <u>decision page</u> for further information, including how to appeal or review your decision.

Drawings 01,02, represent the determined scheme. Full details of the application can be found on the <u>Planning and Building Standards Online Services</u>

The reason why the Council made this decision is as follows:

The proposal complies with Sections 59 and 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 as it will not harm the listed building or its setting and it will preserve or enhance the character or appearance of the conservation area.

The change of use of this property to a short term let (STL) is acceptable in terms of neighbouring amenity. The loss of the residential accommodation has not been justified. Whilst it is recognised that there is an economic benefit to the city as a whole from the provision of tourist accommodation, in this case it does not outweigh the adverse impact on loss of residential accommodation. The proposal does not comply with the Development Plan policy NPF 4 policy 30(e) ii. There are no material considerations that outweigh this conclusion. The proposal is unacceptable.

This determination does not carry with it any necessary consent or approval for the proposed development under other statutory enactments.

Should you have a specific enquiry regarding this decision please contact Lesley Porteous directly at lesley.porteous@edinburgh.gov.uk.

Chief Planning Officer PLACE The City of Edinburgh Council

# NOTES

1. If the applicant is aggrieved by the decision to refuse permission for or approval required by a condition in respect of the proposed development, or to grant permission or approval subject to conditions, the applicant may require the planning authority to review the case under section 43A of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 within three months beginning with the date of this notice. The Notice of Review can be made online at www.eplanning.scot or forms can be downloaded from that website. Paper forms should be addressed to the City of Edinburgh Planning Local Review Body, G.2, Waverley Court, 4 East Market Street, Edinburgh, EH8 8BG. For enquiries about the Local Review Body, please email localreviewbody@edinburgh.gov.uk.

2. If permission to develop land is refused or granted subject to conditions and the owner of the land claims that the land has become incapable of reasonably beneficial use in its existing state and cannot be rendered capable of reasonably beneficial use by carrying out of any development which has been or would be permitted, the owner of the land may serve on the planning authority a purchase notice requiring the purchase of the owner of the land's interest in the land accordance with Part 5 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997.

# **Report of Handling**

# Application for Planning Permission STL 6 Stafford Street, Edinburgh, EH3 7AU

Proposal: Change of use: Sui Generis flatted residential to short-term let accommodation (in retrospect).

Item – Local Delegated Decision Application Number – 22/06066/FULSTL Ward – B11 - City Centre

# Recommendation

It is recommended that this application be **Refused** subject to the details below.

#### Summary

The proposal complies with Sections 59 and 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 as it will not harm the listed building or its setting and it will preserve or enhance the character or appearance of the conservation area.

The change of use of this property to a short term let (STL) is acceptable in terms of neighbouring amenity. The loss of the residential accommodation has not been justified. Whilst it is recognised that there is an economic benefit to the city as a whole from the provision of tourist accommodation, in this case it does not outweigh the adverse impact on loss of residential accommodation. The proposal does not comply with the Development Plan policy NPF 4 policy 30(e) ii. There are no material considerations that outweigh this conclusion. The proposal is unacceptable.

# **SECTION A – Application Background**

# Site Description

The application site is a two-storey terraced townhouse with accommodation in the roofspace at 6, Stafford Street at the west end of the city centre. The property has its own main door between two retail units. The immediate area is predominantly mixed with retail, commercial uses, offices and some residential.

The application site is a B listed building (ref: LB 29830: date of listing 14.12.1970).

The application site lies within the New Town Conservation Area and the Old and New Towns of Edinburgh World Heritage Site.

# **Description Of The Proposal**

The application is for a change of use from flatted residential to short term let (suigeneris). No internal or external physical changes are proposed. The property has been used for short term let since 2016, therefore the application is retrospective.

#### Supporting Information

Planning Statement. National Planning Framework 4 Planning Statement.

# **Relevant Site History**

13/01892/FUL 6 Stafford Street Edinburgh EH3 7AU Change of Use (Office, Class 4 to Residential, Class 9) and alterations, including the installation of a new bathroom, kitchen, en suite, conservation rooflights to rear elevation, sash and case window upgrade and period style feature fireplace to livingroom. Granted

26 June 2013

# **Other Relevant Site History**

No other relevant planning site history.

**Consultation Engagement** No consultations.

#### Publicity and Public Engagement

Date of Neighbour Notification: 23 May 2023 Date of Advertisement: 16 December 2022 Date of Site Notice: 16 December 2022 Number of Contributors: 1

**Section B - Assessment** 

**Determining Issues** 

Due to the proposals relating to a listed building(s) and being within a conservation area, this report will first consider the proposals in terms of Sections 59 and 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 (the "1997 Heritage Act"):

a) Is there a strong presumption against granting planning permission due to the proposals:

(i) harming the listed building or its setting? or

(ii) conflicting with the objective of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of the conservation area?

b) If the strong presumption against granting planning permission is engaged, are there any significant public interest advantages of the development which can only be delivered at the scheme's proposed location that are sufficient to outweigh it?

This report will then consider the proposed development under Sections 24, 25 and 37 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 (the 1997 Act):

Having regard to the legal requirement of Section 24(3), in the event of any policy incompatibility between National Planning Framework 4 (NPF4) & Edinburgh Local Development Plan 2016 (LDP) the newer policy shall prevail.

Do the proposals comply with the development plan?

If the proposals do comply with the development plan, are there any compelling material considerations for not approving them?

If the proposals do not comply with the development plan, are there any compelling material considerations for approving them?

In the assessment of material considerations this report will consider:

- equalities and human rights;
- public representations; and
- any other identified material considerations.

# Assessment

# a) The proposals harm the listed building and its setting?

The following HES guidance is relevant in the determination of this application:

• Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Interim Guidance on the principles of listed building consent.

• Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Setting.

Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Interim Guidance on the principles of listed building consent sets out the principles for assessing the impact of a development on a listed building.

Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Setting sets out the principles that apply to developments affecting the setting of historic assets or places including listed buildings and conservation areas. It includes factors to be considered in assessing the impact of a change on the setting.

There are no external or internal alterations proposed. As such, the proposal will not have an adverse impact on or cause harm to the listed building. The setting of the listed building and the setting of neighbouring listed buildings will be unaffected by the proposal.

# Conclusion in relation to the listed building

The proposal harms neither the listed building or its setting. It is therefore acceptable with regard to Sections 59 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas)(Scotland) Act 1997.

# b) The proposals harm the character or appearance of the conservation area?

Section 64(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 states:

"In exercise, with respect to any buildings or other land in a conservation area, of any powers under any of the provisions in subsection (2), special attention shall be paid to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of that area."

The New Town Conservation Area Character Appraisal states that the area is typified by the formal plan layout, spacious stone built terraces, broad streets and an overall classical elegance. The buildings are of a generally consistent three storey and basement scale, with some four storey corner and central pavilions.

There are no external changes proposed. The change of use from a residential premises to a short term let will not have any material impact on the character of the conservation area. The change of use would preserve the appearance of the conservation area.

# Conclusion in relation to the conservation area

The proposals are acceptable with regard to Section 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997.

# c) The proposals comply with the development plan?

National Planning Framework 4 (NPF4) was adopted by the Scottish Ministers on 13 February 2023 and forms part of the Council's Development Plan. NPF4 policies supports the planning and delivery of Sustainable Places, Liveable Places and Productive Places and are the key policies against which proposals for development are assessed. Several policies in the Edinburgh Local Development Plan (LDP) are superseded by equivalent and alternative policies within NPF4. The relevant policies to be considered are:

- NPF4 Sustainable Places Policy 1.
- NPF4 Historic Assets and Places Policy 7.
- NPF4 Productive Places Tourism Policy 30.

- LDP Housing Policy Hou 7.
- LDP Transport Policies Tra 2 and Tra 3.

The non-statutory 'Listed Buildings and Conservation Area' guidance is a material consideration that is relevant when considering historic assets. The non-statutory 'Guidance for Businesses' (2023) is a material consideration that is

relevant when considering change of use applications.

### Listed Buildings, Conservation Area and Edinburgh World Heritage Site

There are no external or internal works proposed and as such there will not be a significant impact on historic assets and places. The proposal complies with NPF 4 Policy 7.

#### Proposed Use

With regards to NPF 4 Policy 1, the proposals do not involve operational development. The proposals will have a negligible impact on the global climate and nature crisis.

NPF 4 Policy 30 seeks to encourage, promote and facilitate sustainable tourism development which benefits local people, is consistent with our net zero and nature commitments, and inspires people to visit Scotland. Criterion 30 (e) specifically relate to STL proposals.

LDP Policy Hou 7 (Inappropriate Uses in Residential Areas), seeks to protect residential amenity.

The non-statutory Guidance for Businesses (2023) states that an assessment of a change of use of dwellings to a short term let will have regard to:

- The character of the new use and of the wider area;

- The size of the property;

- The pattern of activity associated with the use including numbers of occupants, the period of use, issues of noise, disturbance and parking demand; and

- The nature and character of any services provided.

#### Amenity

The application property has its own main door access directly on to Stafford Street.

The applicant submitted a planning statement in response to the NPF 4 policies. The statement suggests that there would be no unacceptable impact on the local amenity of the area as the application has its own main door access and already in the area there is a high level of night time activity.

The application site is fairly close to Shandwick Place where there are restaurants, pubs, bars, and other premises that operate into the early hours. This results in an amenity level that is below that which would be experienced in other, quieter locations within the city centre. There are some residential properties in Stafford Street, however, the impact of this STL use, on these residential properties, would essentially be masked by the background noise levels created by the uses and resultant activities that

exist within the vicinity of the application property. The application property has its own main door access and there are commercial properties on either side.

The additional servicing that operating a property as an STL requires compared to that of a residential use could result in an increase in disturbance, impacting on neighbouring amenity. However, this would be of lesser impact as it is likely that servicing would be conducted during the daytime.

The proposal complies with NPF 4 policy 30(e) part (i) and LDP policy Hou 7.

# Loss of residential accommodation

NPF 4 policy 30 (e) part (ii) requires that where there is a loss of residential accommodation, this will only be supported where the loss is outweighed by demonstrable local economic benefits.

Paragraph 220 of the LDP acknowledges that tourism is the biggest source of employment in Edinburgh, providing jobs for over 31,000 people. The use of the property by guests and the required maintenance and upkeep of STL properties are likely to result in a level of job creation and spend within the economy which can be classed as having an economic benefit.

The applicant's planning statement sets out that the property's short term let visitors will visit local restaurants, shops and pubs. It states that the STL use will offer visitors flexible accommodation which will help the city's arts festivals and the economy generally. The applicant's supporting statement confirms that the property has a history of commercial use and was converted to residential use in 2013. Since that time the property has never been used as a permanent residence, the implication being that no residential accommodation would be lost.

The current lawful use of the property is for residential accommodation. Consequently, the use of the property as an STL would result in a loss of residential accommodation, which given the recognised need and demand for housing in Edinburgh is important to retain, where appropriate.

Further, it is important to recognise that residential occupation of the property contributes to the economy, in terms of providing a home and the spend in relation to the use of the property as a home, including the use of local services and resultant employment, as well as by making contributions to the local community.

In this instance, it has not been sufficiently demonstrated that the loss of the residential accommodation is outweighed by demonstrable local economic benefits. As such, the proposal does not comply with NPF 4 30(e) part (ii).

# Car Parking

There is no vehicle parking and no cycle parking. Zero parking is acceptable as there is no requirement for cycle parking for STLs. Cycles could be parked inside the property.

The proposals comply with LDP Policies Tra 2 and Tra 3.

# Conclusion in relation to the Development Plan

The change of use of this property to an STL is acceptable with regard to neighbouring amenity. However, the loss of the residential accommodation has not been justified. Whilst it is recognised that there is an economic benefit to the city as a whole from the provision of tourist accommodation in this case it does not outweigh the loss of residential accommodation. The proposal complies with LDP policy Hou 7 but does not comply with the Development Plan policy NPF 4 policy 30(e) (ii).

# d) There are any other material considerations which must be addressed?

The following material planning considerations have been identified:

# Emerging policy context

City Plan 2030 represents the settled will of the Council, and it has been submitted to Scottish Ministers for examination. As such, limited weight can be attached to it as a material consideration in the determination of this application.

# Equalities and human rights

Due regard has been given to section 149 of the Equalities Act 2010. No impacts have been identified.

Consideration has been given to human rights. No impacts have been identified through the assessment and no comments have been received in relation to human rights.

# Public representations

A summary of the representations is provided below:

#### material considerations

-Too many STLs are changing the character of the area. Addressed in b) and c) above.

#### non-material considerations

-There are too many STLs in the surrounding area. Each application has to be assessed on its individual merits.

# Conclusion in relation to identified material considerations

Identified material considerations have been assessed above and do not raise issues which outweigh the conclusion in relation to the development plan.

# Overall conclusion

The proposal complies with Sections 59 and 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 as it will not harm the listed building or its setting and it will preserve or enhance the character or appearance of the conservation area.

The change of use of this property to an STL is acceptable in terms of neighbouring amenity. The loss of the residential accommodation has not been justified. Whilst it is

recognised that there is an economic benefit to the city as a whole from the provision of tourist accommodation, in this case it does not outweigh the adverse impact on loss of residential accommodation. The proposal does not comply with the Development Plan policy NPF 4 policy 30(e) ii. There are no material considerations that outweigh this conclusion. The proposal is unacceptable.

# **Section C - Conditions/Reasons/Informatives**

The recommendation is subject to the following; **Conditions** 

# Reasons

# Reason for Refusal

1. The proposal is contrary to National Planning Framework 4 Policy 30(e) (ii) in respect of Loss of Residential Accommodation, as the the loss of a residential property has not been justified.

# Background Reading/External References

To view details of the application go to the Planning Portal

Further Information - Local Development Plan

Date Registered: 2 December 2022

# Drawing Numbers/Scheme

01,02

Scheme 1

David Givan Chief Planning Officer PLACE The City of Edinburgh Council

Contact: Lesley Porteous, Planning Officer E-mail:lesley.porteous@edinburgh.gov.uk Appendix 1

# Consultations

No consultations undertaken.

# **Comments for Planning Application 22/06066/FULSTL**

# **Application Summary**

Application Number: 22/06066/FULSTL Address: 6 Stafford Street Edinburgh EH3 7AU Proposal: Change of use: Sui Generis flatted residential to short-term let accommodation (in retrospect). Case Officer: Improvement Team

# **Customer Details**

Name: John Johnson Address: 8 Stafford Street Edinburgh

# **Comment Details**

Commenter Type: Neighbour Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application Comment Reasons: Comment:Stafford Street and surrounding area is swamped with air b&b flats Too many close together changing the character of the area